Promoting inclusive parliaments:
The representation of minorities and
indigenous peoples in parliament

Desk review of literature
on the representation of minorities and indigenous peoples in parliament
December 2008

Prepared by Andrew Reynolds
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, USA

Institutional Research

1. The United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) project - Ethnic Structure, Inequality and Governance of the Public Sector – touches, to some degree, on issues of minority representation. It focuses on the ways in which ethnic minorities are incorporated into governance and public sector institutions in 15 nations (Fiji, Trinidad, Latvia, Belgium, Bosnia, Switzerland, Malaysia, Nigeria, Ghana, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Tanzania, Botswana, Lithuania, and India). For most cases data is provided for minorities in parliament and cabinet (see *Ethnic Structure, Inequality and Governance of the Public Sector – A Comparative Study*, Yusuf Bangura, Geneva, UNRISD, 2005).

2. To date the most extensive survey of minority parliamentarian presence is *Electoral Systems and the Protection and Participation of Minorities*, Andrew Reynolds (London, Minority Rights Group International, 2006) which covered 33 nation states. The data was broadened to cover 50 states in the MRG *State of the World's Minorities* annual report 2007.

3. The FEMCIT project is to survey political parties in Europe on their provisions for quotas for women and minorities. (http://www.femcit.org/).

4. The Advisory Committee of the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities produced a thematic commentary on the Effective Participation of National Minorities in 2008 ("Advisory Committee on the framework convention for the protection of national minorities," Strasbourg, May 5, 2008). While the European Center for Minority Issues is coordinating the preparation of a commentary, which will review international standards and practice relating to the political participation of minorities. It will be published in 2009, on the occasion of the tenth anniversary of the adoption of the OSCE *Lund Recommendations on the Effective Participation of National Minorities in Public Life*.

4. Other groups working in the elections and democracy field have not collected systematic data on minority representation (e.g., International IDEA, the Carter Center, International Foundation for Election Systems (IFES), National Democratic Institute (NDI), International Republican Institute (IRI), the World Bank, Westminster Foundation, and Open Society).

Academic Research

To date the body of academic research which focuses on minority representation has been characterized by: being country specific rather than globally comparative, deals with national legislative presence rather than executive or local government structures, and is empirically and theoretically undeveloped when compared to the related literature on women's representation.

In essence there are three core questions:

1. How many minority parliamentarians are actually present in national legislatures?

2. What factors determine the levels of minority inclusion?

3. What are the consequences of minority representation? That is, what is the relationship between presence and influence, between minorities being included in institutions of governance and the protection and status of such minority groups?

Current state of research on minority representation

The bulk of the research that has been published on the topic revolves around discussions of voting rights and minority representation in the United States, the effect of electoral systems on the election of minority parliamentarians, how minority representation fits into power sharing constructs, and surveys of special mechanisms for including minority parliamentarians in parliament.

The two most relevant multi-country comparative surveys are Anna Jarstad's *Changing the Game: Consociational Theory and Ethnic Quotas in Cyprus and New Zealand* (Uppsala University Press, 2001) which includes details of 17 countries with 'ethnic quotas. This information was expanded to 33 cases in Reynolds "Reserved Seats in National Legislatures" (2005). The Jarstad thesis offered analysis of the effect of these ethnic quotas on politics in New Zealand and Cyprus while the Reynolds piece focused on the variety of mechanisms used without engaging fully the question of the utility of such 'reserved seats.' Jarstad wrote about minority representation as component parts of peace settlements in her chapter on power sharing in power sharing in *From War to Democracy*, (eds. Jarstad and Sisk, Cambridge University Press, 2008).

Other related research

1. Comparative surveys

Alongside the broadly comparative works mentioned above there are a number of works which compare two or more countries. To varying degrees each work entertains one or more of the three core questions.

Banducci, Susan A, Donovan, Todd and Karp, Jeffrey A. "Minority representation, empowerment, and participation." (New Zealand and the United States) *Journal of Politics,* vol. 66 no. 2, pp. 534-556, Feb 2004.

Bird, Karen. "The political representation of visible minorities in electoral democracies: a comparison of France, Denmark, and Canada." *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics*, vol. 11 no. 4, pp. 425-465, 2005

Bird, Karen. "The Political Representation of Women and Ethnic Minorities in Established Democracies: A Framework for Comparative Research." Working Paper presented for the Academy of Migration Studies in Denmark (AMID). November, 2003.

http://ksghome.harvard.edu/~pnorris/acrobat/stm103%20articles/Karen%20Bird%20amidpaper.pdf

Verstichel, Annelies. "Special measures to promote minority representation in elected bodies: the experience of the OSCE HCNM." Council of Europe, 2008.

2. Women and minority representation

There are a few works which specifically look at the links between the representation of women and marginalized minorities. These articles focus mostly on the impact of minority legislators on public policy. Research that focuses on female minority parliamentarians, a double layer of marginalization, are rare.

Burlet, Stacey and Reid, Helen. "A gendered uprising: political representation and minority ethnic communities." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol. 21 no. 2, pp. 270-287, Mar 1998

Crowley, Jocelyn Elise. "When tokens matter." *Legislative Studies Quarterly*, vol. XXIX no. 1, pp. 109-136, Feb 2004.

Htun, Mala. "Is Gender like Ethnicity? The Political Representation of Identity Groups." *Perspectives on Politics*, September 2004.

Kostadinova, Tatiana. "Ethnic and Women's Representation Under Mixed Election Systems." *Electoral Studies*. Volume 26. Issue 2. June 2007.

Case Studies

1. United States/Canada

There are a number of studies of ethnic/racial minority representation in the United States Congress and US State Legislatures. A selection of the most recent includes:

Articles dealing with the variables which determine minority electoral success

Bowler, Shaun, Donovan, Todd and Brockington, David. "Electoral reform and minority representation: local experiments with alternative elections." *Perspectives on Politics*, vol. 2 no. 1, pp. 136-137, Mar 2004

Brockington, David, Donovan, Todd, Bowler, Shaun and Brischetto, Robert. "Minority representation under cumulative and limited voting." *Journal of Politics*, vol. 60 no. 4, pp. 1108-1125, Nov 1998

Canon, David T. "Electoral systems and the representation of minority interests in Legislatures." *Legislative Studies Quarterly*, vol. XXIV no. 3, pp. 331-385, Aug 1999

Casonato, Carlo. "E pluribus: unum? The political representation of ethnic minorities in the U.S.A." *Europa Ethnica*, vol. 56 no. 1-2, pp. 35-50, 2000

Hajnal, Zoltan and Trounstine, Jessica. "Where turnout matters: the consequences of uneven turnout in city." *Journal of Politics*, vol. 67 no. 2, pp. 515-535, May 2005.

Simard, Carolle. "Ethnic Minority Political Representation in Montreal." Paper Tabled at Fourth National Metropolis Conference. Toronto, March 2000. http://ceris.metropolis.net/events/4metpres/simard_e.pdf

Weaver, Sally. "Political Representativity and Indigenous Minorities in Canada and Australia in Dyck, Ed. *Indigenous Peoples and the Nation-state: "Fourth World" Politics in Canada, Australia and Norway* (St. John's, Nfld: Memorial University of Newfoundland Institute of Social and Economic Research, 1985).

Articles dealing with the consequences of minority representation in US/Canada

Preuhs, Robert R. "The conditional effects of minority descriptive representation: black legislators and policy influence in the American states." *Journal of Politics*, vol. 68 no. 3, pp. 585-599, Aug 2006.

Sass, Tim R. and Mehay, Stephen L. "Minority representation, election method, and policy influence." *Economics and Politics*, vol. 15 no. 3, pp. 323-339, Nov 2003

Simard, Carolle. "Ethnic minority elected officials in Montreal: political representation and perceptions, an investigation." *Politique et Sociétés*, vol. 22 no. 1, pp. 53-78, 2003

Rush, Mark E and Engstrom, Richard L. "Fair and effective representation? Debating electoral reform and minority rights." *Journal of Legislative Studies*, vol. 8 no. 3, pp. 132-133, 2002.

2. Asia-Pacific

A number of case studies of legislatures in the Asia-Pacific region consider degrees of minority inclusion, while others look at ethnic electoral inclusion as a component art of conflict management in the divided society of Sri Lanka.

Shastri, Amita. "Channeling ethnicity through electoral reform in Sri Lanka." *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*, vol. 43 no. 1, pp. 34-60, Mar 2005.

Shrivastava, Rashmi. "Minority representation of a political majority group (India)." *Indian Journal of Political Science*, vol. LXVI no. 2, pp. 233-252, Apr-Jun 2005.

Trease, Howard Van. "The operation of the single non-transferable vote system in Vanuatu." *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*, vol. 43 no. 3, pp. 296-332, Nov 2005.

Warnapala, Yajni and Yehiya, Zufni Bobby. "Minority electoral politics: a Sri Lankan case study." *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, vol. 40 no. 6, pp. 439-462, Dec 2005.

3. Minority representation as a component part of power sharing theory

The following works address minority representation as an element of power sharing or consociational structures.

Eichhorst, Kristina and Svenia Sinjen. "The Iraqi Constitution – A Suitable Instrument for the Solution of Ethnic Conflicts?". Politische Studien, vol. 57, no. 405 (2006).

Hadden, Tom. *Integration and autonomy: minority rights and political accommodation: Power sharing; new challenges for divided societies*. London, Ann Arbor MI: Pluto Press, 2005

Reynolds, Andrew. Electoral Systems and Democratization in Southern Africa. Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1999.

Sarakinsky, Ivor. "Reflections on the Politics of Minorities, Race and Opposition in Contemporary South Africa". *Democratization*. Volume 8. No. 1. 2001.

Schwartz, Andrew. "Affirmative action and electoral engineering." *Philosophy in the Contemporary World*, vol. 9 no. 2, pp. 93-100, 2002

Waskiewicz, Andrzej. "Do ethnic and national minorities have right to democratic representation?" *Kultura i Spoleczenstwo*, vol. XLVII no. 1, pp. 143-150, 2003.

Wilkinson, Steven Ian. "India, Consociational Theory, and Ethnic Violence." *Asian Survey*. Vol. 4 No. 5. Sep.-Oct. 2000.

4. Eastern Central European Case Studies

Alionescu, Ciprian-Calin. "Parliamentary Representation of Minorities in Romania". *Southeast European Politics*. Volume 5. No. 5. 2004. http://www.seep.ceu.hu/archives/issue51/alionescu.pdf

Benoit-Rohmer, Florence and Hilde Hardeman. "Political Representation of Minorities in the Parliaments of Central and Eastern Europe." *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*. Volume 2 . No. 2 (1994)

Borók, György. "Regulation models of the Parliamentary representation of national and ethnic minorities in Europe and Hungary." *Társadalmi Szemle*, vol. 53 no. 4, pp. 68-84, 1998.

"Developing a Minority Policy in Montenegro". Project on Ethnic Relations First Roundtable. Przno, Montenegro. Oct 21-22, 2005.

http://www.per-usa.org/Reports/CG%20%20MIN%20POLICY%20I%20REPORT.pdf

Edinger, Michael and Mindaugus Kuklys. "Ethnic Minorities in Parliament, Representation in East European Comparison". *Osteuropa*. Volume 57. No. 11. 2007.

Friedman, Eben. "Electoral System Design and Minority Representation in Slovakia and Macedonia." *Ethnopolitics*. Volume 4. No. 4. 2005.

Klímová-Alexander, Ilona. "Development and institutionalisation of Romani representation and administration." *Nationalities Papers*, vol. 32 no. 3, pp. 599-629, Sep 2004

Klímová-Alexander, Ilona. "Romani political representation in Central Europe: An historical survey," *Romani Studies*, Series 5, Vol. 12, No. 2, 103-147.

Korhecz, Tamas. "Democratic legitimacy and election rules of national ethnic minority bodies and representatives - reflections on legal solutions in Hungary and Slovenia." *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*, vol. 9 no. 2, pp. 161-182, 2002

Palermo, Francesco and Jens Woelk. "No Representation Without Recognition: The Right to political Participation of National Minorities". *Journal of European Integration*. Volume 25. Issue 3. 2003.

Pap, A.L. "Representation or Ethnic Balance: Ethnic minorities in Parliaments". *Journal of East European Law*. Volume 7 (2000).

"Parliament as a Guardian of Human Rights" Inter-parliamentary Symposium, IPU. Budapest, Hungary 19-22 May, 1993.

Petricusic, Antonija. "The Rights of Minorities in International Law". *Croatian International Relations Review*. Volume 11. No. 38-39. 2005.

Resler, Tamara. "Dilemmas of Democritization: Safeguarding Minorities in Russia, Ukraine, and Lithuania". *Europe-Asia Studies*. Volume 49. No. 1 (1997).

Sobotka, Eva. "The Limits of the State: Political Participation and Representation of Roma in the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland and Slovakia" *Journal on Ethnopolitics and Minority Issues*, No.1 (2001)

Project on Ethnic Relations, *Leadership, Representation and the Status of the Roma*. Princeton: Project on Ethnic Relations (2001)

Project on Ethnic Relations, *State Policies toward Romani Communities in Candidate Countries to the EU: Government and Romani Participation in Policy-Making*. Princeton: Project on Ethnic Relations (1999).

5. Western European Case Studies

Chaney, Paul and Fevre, Ralph. "Is there a demand for descriptive representation? Evidence from the UK's devolution programme." *Political Studies*, vol. 50 no. 5, pp. 897-915, Dec 2002

Geddes, Andrew. "Explaining ethnic minority representation: contemporary trends in the shadow of the past." *British Elections and Parties Review*, vol. 11, pp. 119-135, 2001

Jacobs, Dirk. "Multinational and polyethnic politics entwined: minority representation in the region of Brussels-capital." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, vol. 26 no. 2, pp. 289-304, Apr 2000

Smith, Graham and Stephenson, Susan. "The theory and practice of group representation: reflections on the governance of race equality in Birmingham." *Public Administration*, vol. 83 no. 2, pp. 323-344, 2005.

Togeby, Lise. "The Political Representation of Ethnic Minorities: Denmark as a Deviant Case," *Party Politics* (14,3, pp.325-343).

Related data sets

ACE Project. "Comparative Data: Parties and Candidates". ACE Project Electoral Knowledge Network. http://aceproject.org/epic-en/pc

"Social and General Statistics: Ethnic Minorities in Politics and Government". House of Commons Library. 2004. http://www.parliament.uk/commons/lib/research/notes/snsg-01156.pdf

"CDL-INF (2000) 004: Droit Electoral et Minorites Nationales". Venice Commission, Council of Europe. 2000. http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2000/CDL-INF(2000)004-e.asp

Extensive review (text and tables) of electoral systems, constituencies, and provisions for minority guarantees in COE countries.

Further bibliographic references on related issues

Baldwin, Clive. 2006. *Minority Rights in Kosovo under International Rule*. London, MRGI.

Bogaards, Matthis. 2004. "Electoral Systems and the Management of Ethnic Conflict in the Balkans," in Alina Mungiu-Pippidi and Ivan Krastev. *National after Communism: Lessons Learned*. Budapest, CPS Books.

Bose, Sumantra. 2002. *Bosnia after Dayton: Nationalist Partition and International Intervention*. London, Hurst and Company.

Chaney, Paul and Ralph Fevre. "Is There a Demand for Descriptive Representation? Evidence from the UK's Devolution Programme". *Political Studies*. Volume 50. Number 5. 2002.

Cohen, Frank. 1997. "Proportional versus Majoritarian Ethnic Conflict Management in Democracies. *Comparative Political Studies*. Vol.30, No.5.

Fraenkel, Jon and Bernard Grofman. 2005. "Introduction- Political Culture, Representation and Electoral Systems in the Pacific Islands." *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*. Vol.43, No.3.

Frowein, J.A. and Roland Bank. "The Participation of Minorities in Decision-Making Processes". Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law for DH-MIN/COE. 2000. http://www.humanrights.coe.int/minorities/eng/InterGovernmental/Publications/DHMIN(2000)1.ang.doc

"Guidelines to Assist National Minority Participation in the Electoral Process". ODIHR/IDEA. Warsaw, 2001. http://aceproject.org/ero-en/topics/electoral-participation/minority-and-refugee-voting/UNPAN016497.pdf/view

Heintze, Hans-Joachim. " Implementation of Minority Rights Through the Devolution of Power – The Concept of Autonomy Reconsidered." *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*. Volume 9. No. 4. 2002.

Guinier, Lani. 1994. *The Tyranny of the Majority*. New York, Free Press.

Horowitz, Donald. 2003. "Electoral Systems: A Primer for Decision Makers," *Journal of Democracy* Vol. 14, No.4.

Juberias, Flores. 2000. "Post Communist Electoral systems and National Minorities," in Jonathan Stein (ed.) *The Politics of National Minority Participation in Post Communist Europe*. Armonk: M.E.Sharpe.

Karam, Azza.(ed.) 1998. *Women in Parliament Beyond Numbers*. Stockholm, International IDEA.

Kaspin, Deborah. 1995. "The Politics of Ethnicity in Malawi's Democratic Transition," *Journal of Modern African Studies* 33: 595-620.

Lewis, W. Arthur. 1965. *Politics in West Africa*, London: Allen & Unwin.

Lijphart, Arend. 1977. *Democracy in Plural Societies*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Lijphart, Arend. 1995. "Self-Determination versus Pre-Determination of Ethnic Minorities in Power Sharing Systems," in Will Kymlicka (ed) *The Rights of Minority Cultures*. Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Lijphart, Arend. 1996. "The puzzle of Indian Democracy: a consociational interpretation," *American Political Science Review*. Vol. 90, No.2.

Norris, Pippa. 2002. "Ballots not Bullets: Testing Consociational Theories of Ethnic Conflict, Electoral Systems and Democratization," in Andrew Reynolds (ed.) *The Architecture of Democracy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Reynolds, Andrew, Ben Reilly and Andrew Ellis. 2005. *The New International IDEA Handbook of Electoral System Design*. IDEA, Stockholm.

Reynolds, Andrew. 2005. "Reserved Seats in National Legislatures," *Legislative Studies Quarterly*. Vol XXV, No.3.

Reynolds, Andrew and Marco Steenbergen. 2006. "How the World Votes: The Political Consequences of Ballot Design, Innovation and Manipulation," *Electoral Studies*, Vol.25, No.4.

Reynolds, Andrew, Jeffrey Saltzman and Susan Stigant. Forthcoming. "The Greatest Test: Consociationalism and Conflict Management in the Sudan."

Roberts, Nigel; Jonathan Boston, Elizabeth Mcleay, and Stephen Levine. (eds.) 1997. From Campaign to Coalition: New Zealand's First General Election Under Proportional Representation. Palmerston North: Dunmore.

Pitkin, Hanna. 1967. *The Concept of Representation*. Berkeley, University of California Press.

Scholdan, Bettina. 2000. "Democratization and Electoral Engineering in Post-Ethnic Conflict Societies," *Javnost* 7 (1).

Sisk, Timothy D. 1996. *Power Sharing and International Medation in Ethnic Conflicts*. Washington D.C.: United States Institute of Peace Press .

Young, Iris. 1997. "Deferring Group Representation," in Ian Shapiro and Will Kymlicka (eds) *Ethnicity and Group Rights*. NOMOS XXXIX, New York, New York University Press.